

EDUCATION POLICIES AND BASIC EDUCATION PROGRAMMES' INFLUENCE ON TEACHERS' INSTRUCTION: A DIAGNOSE OF THE LIFE OF DBAE APPROACH IN BOTSWANA PRIMARY SCHOOLS

Magdeline C. Mannathoko

University of Botswana

[mannathoko@mopipi.ub.bw](mailto:mannahoko@mopipi.ub.bw)

Abstract

Discipline Based Art Education (DBAE) is a method of teaching and learning arts that exposes learners to four vital art disciplines: criticism, aesthetics, art history and art production. Developing knowledge and skills in these four areas, helps students to accomplish in-depth comprehension of visual arts. Thus, in order to understand art, learners must familiarised with the language of art in order to learn how art elements and principles of design are used to create an artwork; ask key philosophical questions about art; develop an understanding of how media, techniques and philosophies of art have evolved over time and be introduced to diverse media when learning art production. It is in this context that the study examined the extent to which Botswana policies and programmes including the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) syllabus addressed DBAE framework; to influence teachers to integrate DBAE in the teaching and learning of visual arts. The study further identified activities which could help incorporate DBAE with upper primary CAPA attainment targets. Content analysis was done on the existing upper primary CAPA syllabus and other policy documents that inform the curriculum to identify overlaps. Results revealed comprehensive aims from the policies which could have helped CAPA syllabus designers specifically art module to adopt the DBAE approached as it is viewed by most art educators globally as a rich method of teaching and learning the arts. The concept of DBAE is not coming out from both the CAPA attainment targets and the art module which is part of the CAPA syllabus. Nevertheless, the attainment targets define diverse knowledge and understanding, skills and attitudes which could be achieved through the use of DBAE framework. Art production and art criticism compared to aesthetics and art history seem to have been addressed in visual arts module objectives. As a result, the study recommends an inclusion of DBAE framework in the CAPA attainment targets and visual art module to guide teachers on their planning and teaching. A follow-study will be necessary to evaluate teachers' implantation of visual arts module in relation to DABE framework.

Key Words: Creative and Performing Arts, Visual Arts Education, Attainment Targets, Discipline-Based Art Education Framework, Art Criticism, Aesthetics, Art History and Art Production.

Introduction

Initially, art in Botswana was implemented in 1992, but only at Junior Secondary Schools level. It was later introduced in primary schools in 2002 but only at lower primary (standard one to four) and progressed to upper primary (standard five to seven) in 2005. Prior to the introduction of the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) syllabus, art in Botswana primary schools was taught without a syllabus to guide teachers hence everyone in primary schools could teach what he or she thought to be art. As a result, it was optional (Dichaba, 2002). The Report of the National Commission on Education (RNCE, 1993) then found it important for schools to have

guidelines and suggested immediate inclusion of practical subjects in the primary school curriculum, among them art. The suggestion was adopted by the Revised National Policy on Education (1994) and hence the kick off of CAPA syllabus in 2002 (Phuthego, 2008). The Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002) note that the syllabus was designed with the intention to meet the requirements of the Revised National Policy on Education (1994) which prescribe that a wide range of practical subjects be included in the primary school programme to help students develop an understanding and appreciation of technology, manipulative skills and various art media.

CAPA is an umbrella for various disciplines which include: art and craft, music, physical education, design and technology, home economics, business studies, dance and drama hence it draws its content from these subjects (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit, 2002). The grouping of these subjects was suggested by the American agency called 'Cream Wright' which was assigned by the Ministry of Education, Skills and Development to review the primary school curriculum (Phibion, 2006). To justify for this combination, the agency explained that CAPA subjects were put together to facilitate project teaching and integration (Wright, 1995). Moreover, the Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit (2002, 2005) has specified in the CAPA syllabus, Attainment Targets, which guide teachers on what is expected of pupils at the end of each level of learning lower and upper primary). These Attainment Targets are categorised into four aspects for lower primary: Knowledge and Understanding, Manipulative Skills, Creativity and Attitudes. Upper Primary skills were augmented by adding the aspect of 'Communication' and hence making them five in this level.

The Attainment Targets were intended to guide teachers on what the Botswana Examination Council (BEC) will base their examination questions on, to diagnose the pupils' ability at the end of each of the two levels (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit, 2002, 2005). The Department further produced the general and specific objectives which outline the content to be conveyed at each level of learning. "The CAPA syllabus' main aims, are to help students develop creativity skills; problem solving aptitudes, critical thinking competencies, aesthetic recognition and appreciation, psychomotor dexterity along with positive attitudes towards practical work and productivity" (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department, 2005). The teaching through integrative approach promoted by CAPA curriculum could be achieved by the integration of the four components of DBAE; art criticism, art production, aesthetics and art history. Thus, the study found the need to examine the relevant education policies including CAPA attainment targets to find out the extent to which DBAE is recognised. DBAE framework has the greatest aim of teaching art in its social, cultural and historical context and it combines practical work with theoretical and contextual studies (Dobbs, 1992). Developing knowledge and skills in these areas will help learners gain in-depth knowledge of visual arts.

Current policies, the Training Sector Strategies Plan (ETSSP) (2015-2020) and the National Curriculum and Assessment Framework (NCAF, 2015) advocate for a country's shift from a resource-based economy to a knowledge-based economy. They prescribe significances for quality education which include: comprehensive and relevance of education and hence strengthening skills development resulting in improved learning outcomes. Thus, the DBAE approaches to teaching and learning the visual arts could develop all rounded learners who could

graduate as special in the area at primary level; hence create products for self-reliance. DBAE promotes education in the 21st century goals advocated globally hence the prompt for this study.

Research questions

Two research questions were identified to help the focus of the study.

- To what extent do education policies promote DBAE framework?
- To what extent do Basic Education aims, Primary Education aims and the CAPA attainment targets promote DBAE approaches?

Conceptual Framework

The study was framed within the concept of arts education programming called Discipline-Based Art Education (DBAE). DBAE is an approach to arts education established and formalised in the early 1980s by the Getty Center for Arts Education currently known as the Getty Education Institute which is a division of the J. Paul Getty Trust. J. Paul Getty Trust is a private foundation devoted to the visual arts and the humanities. DBAE's intention is to convey a well-rounded view of art by studying any given work or type of work using four distinct disciplines, designed to specific ages and grade levels. These includes: *Art production*, where students are exposed to skills and techniques in order to produce personal, unique artwork; *Art history* whereby learners study the evolvement of art over time as inspiration. Thus, students discuss artists' styles or techniques especially in relation to cultural, political, social, religious, and economic events and movements; *Art Criticism* which gives students the opportunity to describe, interpret, evaluate, theorise and judge the properties and qualities of the visual form, for the purpose of understanding and appreciating works of art and understanding the roles of art in society and lastly, *Aesthetics* which allows learners to consider the nature, meaning, impact and value of art. They are encouraged to formulate reflective, educated opinions and judgments about specific works of art, and examine criteria for evaluating works of art (Dobbs, 1992). Dobbs further explains that DBAE was originally developed for use with the visual arts and then evolved to encompass the study of multiple fields such as; dance, drama, and music. The approach may also be used in multiple settings, lower and higher education as well as lifelong learning centers and art museums, although it is most commonly applied to the visual arts in a classroom setting.

Like both Visual Thinking Strategies and the New Museum model, Discipline-Based Art Education is a form of inquiry-based training; the focus is on the students and their interests, judgment, reasoning and critical-thinking skills. Open-ended inquiry, group discussions and problem-solving also play significant roles in the curriculum, and classroom teachers are viewed as important collaborators in the process although they also disseminate information and provide direction, where need be (Alabama Institute for Education in the Arts, 2004).

Literature Review

This study examined the extent to which art education policies and the arts attainment targets promoted the DBAE approaches to teaching the arts in primary schools. Thus, this section discusses literature related to the study with more focus on Discipline-Based Art Education framework; since all data will be based on this approach. Discipline-Based Art Education has been viewed by many art educationists to be the most effective approach in the teaching and learning of art. They argue that any comprehensive art education programme should integrate the four DBAE disciplines within the studies in order to prepare a world-round graduate in the area of visual arts.

History of DBAE

As aforementioned, DBAE is a method of teaching and studying art that exposes students to four different art disciplines art production, art criticism, art history and aesthetics. It was designed by the J. Paul Getty Trust in America in the early 1980s to support a diminished emphasis on studio instruction and encouraged education across four aforementioned disciplines within the arts (Greer, 1993). Following its footing in 1982, the Getty Education Institute for the Arts based in America, recommended DBAE as an effective approach to teaching art, arguing that it helps learners experience the visual arts in a variety of ways. According to Greer (1993) the institution's recommendation was an adoption of the ideas of art educators who had been advocating a more holistic, comprehensive, and multifaceted approach to art education.

The value of DBAE in visual art education and its methods of teaching and learning

To help focus in discussion, the rationale will be presented with reference to each component of DBAE to account for the significance of each. I will first discuss the aspect of Art Production which is simply, how to create artwork. Art production refers to the making of art, and it includes various mechanisms of making art, such as use of tools, manipulation of media, form and expression. The discipline of Art Production involves critical thinking and imagination processes and art students get stimulated as they explore or manipulate art media. Its most significance is the expression of the heart, mind and hand (Hickman, 2005). There is no art education program that would be complete without the study of art production. This discipline provides a kinesthetic learning experience and allows students to express themselves through a visual medium. Thus, students should ideally be exposed to a variety of media when studying art production. A thorough study of art production will include: the study of common art terms associated with a particular medium. It will also include in-depth experience with creating artwork using a particular medium or multiple media. The discipline therefore, provides students with an opportunity to express themselves and take ownership in their own studies (Szekely, 2005). For many students, art production creates pride and a joy of expression that instils a love of learning in the student.

The second component Art Criticism is simply, 'talking about art'. It is the examination and discussion of style, formal elements of art and principles of design (Ragans, 2000). Thus, in order to understand art, students must learn how visual elements and principles are used to compose an artwork. Art learners assess the use of these elements and principles by performing a formal critique recommended by Feldman (1994) which follows four chronological steps, description, analysis, interpretation and judgement. Description involves describing what you see in the artwork including the 'credit line' information. In the second step, analysis, students determine how the elements of line, shape, value, texture, colour, space and form are used together to create a complete work of art. They also learn about the art principles of balance, emphasis, variety, harmony, movement, proportion, unity and rhythm and examine how the art elements are combined to express these art principles. For instance, a series of wavy lines could be used to create rhythm (Ragans, 2000). By using the elements and principles to assess a work of art, students develop an understanding of art vocabulary, art composition and overall visual communication Lampert (2006). Art Criticism uses several areas of Bloom's Taxonomy but also involves higher levels of thinking. The third step, interpretation focuses on the diagnosis of the

artwork, to get its meaning while the last step, judgement, allows the viewers to examine whether the artwork is successful or not, looking at how the art elements were used. It also allows for personal feelings about an artwork, that is whether one likes or dislikes the piece of work, with justification to their choices. Watts (2005) views this stage as the critical judgement of specific artworks which allows viewers to look within themselves and ask why they like or dislike the piece of artwork. Choices can vary from one person to another since it allows for individual opinions about the artifact. Thus, involving children in this step will develop their critical, problem solving, self-reliant, self-esteem and creativity skills (Zander, 2004). The third discipline,

The third discipline, Art History, is described as the examination of the artists and art's contribution to the societies and cultures. Studying art history helps students to understand how visual communication has evolved overtime (Dash, 2006). It is not just "who created what and when," but it includes the history of objects and the history of people through art. The study of art history helps us understand the mind of the great artists and how they responded to events and cultures of their time. We can evident how other artists influenced their art styles and social change (Bamford, 2006). Thus, art work provides a unique documentation or records of cultural changes throughout history. Studying historical works gives us insights into the past, and further provides valuable insights and information about the present. Art and culture cannot be separated from one another because both relates to the actions and continuation of a people (Chanda, 2000). As a result, students must study art history to develop an understanding of how media, techniques and philosophies of art have evolved over time. Historical knowledge will help students understand why and how artists have produced art over time. Students will also be able to understand current work within a context of the work that has preceded it (Merwe, 2007). This exposure helps students to contextualize their world and relate to other times and other cultures. Art educationists have proven that art history relates to social studies as it helps us examine historical events through an artist's eyes. The discipline answers the following questions: Why was the artwork created? How was it used? and What was its purpose?

Aesthetics on the other hand, is the philosophy of art. Philosophical questions about art need to be addressed: What is art? What is good art? What is beauty? (Shusterman, 2006). We all react emotionally to artworks. The work of art can upset or excite us. Thus, our values, experiences and thoughts of beauty influence what we think about art. The discipline of aesthetics challenges students to ask key philosophical questions about art. Students may be encouraged to define 'what is art' and 'what is not art'. They may be asked to ascertain if certain works should or should not be included in the art catalogue, which is the group of artworks that are academically studied. In addition, students may be asked to assess cultural influences in the creation of art. Asking students to examine their philosophical beliefs in art allows them to broaden their conceptual horizons of what art can be. It also helps them to break cultural barriers that might limit their scope of art appreciation (Danko-McGhee, 2006). Students will also find that a strong understanding of art vocabulary is necessary to defend their opinions. Moreover, Aesthetics helps students realise what kind of art pleases most people. This is also helpful for them when decorating their homes and choosing clothes.

Furthermore, critical skills are used in Aesthetics because questions such as; why one feels that way or why you came to a specific conclusion may arise. As a result, Aesthetics sometimes go

hand-in-hand with Art Criticism. It is important in the study of art because students are engaged in critical thinking about what they are doing, learning, and how they feel about their art and that of others. In studying art through aesthetic questioning, the answer is not important. The act of working to address or to find solution for the provided question is extremely significant. Thus, DBAE approach is designed to insure that all learners obtain an in-depth study of art (Dhillon, 2006). This framework has been proven through time and research therefore, it should be seriously considered by all the art teachers.

Agosto (1993) in Dobbs (1993) shares conclusions drawn from various researchers on DBAE implementation. She says results revealed that students who use DBAE approach construct knowledge for themselves instead of for teachers; approach works of art from more than a production perspective; their production quality is enhanced by broadened study; their art and language comprehension and vocabularies is enhanced and the arts become an integral part of the total curriculum. As a result, having an in-depth art education is a holistic approach to teaching that invites creating, improvising, interpreting, discussing, writing and thinking about, reporting, and valuing works of arts.

Research Methodology

The purpose of this study was to examine the extent to which education policies and CAPA curriculum attainment targets promoted DBAE framework which is believed by most art educationists especially, in the Western countries to be the most effective method of teaching and learning visual arts. These documents were considered for analysis by virtue of their status as guidelines to curriculum design and methods of teaching and learning. The study adopted the method of document analysis within the qualitative approach which allows the opportunity to review content's suitability to any situation identified as vital for research at a given time. "Document analysis is often used in combination with other qualitative research methods as a means of triangulation—the combination of methodologies in the study of the same phenomenon." The qualitative researcher is required to select multiple (at least two) sources of evidence; that is, to seek convergence and corroboration through the use of different data sources and methods. Apart from documents, such sources include interviews, participant or non-participant observation, and physical artifacts (Yin, 2003).

Researchers such as Bowen (2009, p. 37) explains that "document analysis is a systematic procedure for reviewing or evaluating documents—both printed and electronic (computer-based and Internet-transmitted) material." Similarly to other analytical methods in qualitative research, document analysis prescribe that data be examined and interpreted in order to elicit meaning, gain understanding, and develop empirical knowledge (Corbin & Strauss, 2008 & Rapley, 2007) Thus, Yin (2003) cited in Mannathoko (2009) suggests the following sources of data collection as the most important and commonly used in case studies in addition to interviews and observation methods. There are: documentation, archival records and physical artefacts. Documents contain text and images that have been recorded without a researcher's intervention. Atkinson and Coffey (2003) refer to documents as "social facts, which are produced, shared, and used in socially organised ways" (p. 47). Documents that may be used for systematic evaluation as part of a study take a variety of forms. They include: manuals, books and brochures, diaries, journals, advertisements, attendance registers, letters, memorandum, agendas, announcements, charts, newspapers, minutes of meetings and other written reports and programmes of events

among others. For the purposes of this study, other listed documents as examples have not been evaluated. Thus, Education policies such as the RNPE, 1994, ETSSP, (2015-2020), NCAF, (2015), primary school national curriculum and Botswana national principles and vision 2016 were considered most appropriate to this study as it is procedural for all the departments in the country to adhere to the government policies when developing an operation document within its system (Mannathoko, 2009).

Findings and Discussions

This section presents data collected through ‘document analysis’ to investigate the extent to which DBAE framework was incorporated in education policies and the CAPA attainment targets. The aforementioned documents were examined in relation to the four disciplines of DBAE which include: art criticism, art production, art history and aesthetics identified as contributory to comprehensive visual arts education.

To what extent do education policies promote DBAE framework?

The study examined the main three education policies which guide the operation of the school curriculum hence viewed as influential to the programme implementation. These include: the Revised National Policy on Education (RNPE, 1994), the two newly introduced policies; the Training Sector Strategies Plan (ETSSP, 2015-2020) and the National Curriculum and Assessment Framework (NCAF, 2015). As aforementioned, the RNPE, (1994) emphasizes that education system must develop moral and social values, cultural identity and self – esteem, good citizenship and desirable work ethics (RNPE, 1994). As the CAPA curriculum was a response to the requirement of RNPE (1994), which recommended that “a wide range of practical subjects be included in the primary curriculum in order to help students develop an understanding and appreciation of technology, manipulative skills and familiarity with tools, equipment and materials” (Curriculum Development Division, 2002, p. 1), one would expect its development to expand to frameworks such as that of DBAE to produced graduates with the aforementioned qualities. Developing understanding and appreciation of one’s artwork and that of others would need the introduction of art criticism where learners critique artists’ work to elicit meaning, manipulate art media in exploring various techniques hence addressing the component of art production. Art criticism will develop into aesthetics as understanding specific works and their purpose will lead to seeing its beauty. One would conclude that there was an effort by the RNPE designers to cater for comprehensive visual arts programme and these would need expert in the area of the arts who could align effective methods such as DBAE to promote these aims. Cultural identity and moral and social values could be developed by exposed learners to art history where they will learn the evolvement of art media and techniques over time in each discipline of the visual arts (Bamford, 2006 & Dash, 2006).

Botswana Human Resource Development Council (HRDC) cited in the Training Sector Strategies Plan (ETSSP) (2015-2020) advocate for a country’s shift from a resource-based economy to a knowledge-based economy in line with the Botswana Education policy frameworks such as; Education and Training Sector Strategies Plan (ETSSP, 2015-2020) and National Curriculum and Assessment Framework (NCAF, 2015) whose mandates and priorities include: improving the quality and relevance of education, improving learning outcomes, strengthening skills development and developing new and alternative pathways for education. These sentiments tally with education in the 21st century era advocated globally. The ETSSP

(2015-2020) and NCAF (2015) policies propose the introduction of specialisation at primary school level in order to cater for choice of vocational pathways in accordance with learners' talents. For the project to be successful, primary schools will need experts in various arts disciplines who could offer pupils comprehensive content and practical skills recommended by DBAE approach in order to produce specialist learners hence producing educated and informed citizens advocated by Botswana's Vision 2036. If effectively implemented, the arts can play an important role in leading learners towards the production-oriented skills such as trades and crafts.

To what extent do Basic Education aims, Primary Education aims and the CAPA attainment targets promote DBAE approaches?

To address the second research question, three documents: the national basic education programme, primary Education curriculum and the upper primary CAPA syllabus were examined in relation to disciplines of DBAE. The focus for the first two documents was on the aims considering that basic education aims dictate general requirements of a quality basic education graduate. It defines the expectations of both primary and secondary education while the primary education curriculum specifically specifies required outcomes for a primary education graduate. On the other hand, CAPA syllabus requirements relies on both the basic education and primary education prescriptions hence the two documents informs its design specifically development of specific disciplines' attainment targets determines appropriate content for that level. On the other hand, for the CAPA syllabus the focus was on the attainment targets as they prescribe the required knowledge understanding, skills, and attitudes for the primary school education hence determine the appropriate methods for teaching and learning the visual arts.

Aims of Botswana Basic Education

Basic education programme which informs the secondary and primary education as it is the first stage in children's learning, requires students to develop practical skills, problem solving, critical thinking, individual initiative, interpersonal and inquiry skills, self-evaluation capabilities, desirable attitudes towards their environment and the need sustaining utilization of natural resources on completion of primary education (Curriculum Development & Evaluation Unit (2002). In addition, learners are expected to acquire knowledge and understanding of their society through appreciation of their culture and tradition (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit, 2005). Thus, in visual art perspective, learners should have knowledge of the background of the media and techniques used by artists over time and the place, time and reason for creating different artwork in order to appreciate each piece and this is 'art history' and appreciation of the work will be addressing the discipline of 'aesthetics'. All these requirements are in line with the RNPE (1994) which requires primary school completers to have attained practical skills and be prepared for the world of work. These are guidelines which describe the successful primary education graduate and thus, challenge teachers to identify appropriate approaches for each discipline which can help develop the complete graduate. Skills defined by the aims of basic education for example, practical skills, problem solving, critical thinking, individual initiative, interpersonal and inquiry skills, self-evaluation capabilities can be effectively achieved by applying DBAE framework as a method of teaching and learning (Mannathoko, 2016). Practical skills can be achieved by effectively engaging learners in art

production discipline and as they are involved in the process of solving the assigned problem, they will be developing problem solving and research skills, critical thinking and independence; in the process of creating the product, they will be encouraged to evaluate each stage and be flexible in changing media and techniques chosen. Samples of the work for the introduced concept for example; painting could be brought to class for students to critique using Feldman's (1974) methods of art criticism which guides students in getting the meaning of artwork (Zander, 2004). It advises art critics to diagnose the success of the artwork through discussion of the use art elements and principles of design which are guidelines of visual art creation. Art elements and principles of design are regarded as the language of art (Ragans, 2000).

Aims of Primary Education Programme

As aforementioned, the primary education programme includes the general aims for all the subjects in the primary curricular so as to guide teachers on what is expected of children when they complete the primary education level. Attributes advocated include: curiosity, creativity, assertiveness, self-esteem, open-mindedness, and respect for the environment and for one's own life (Curriculum Development and Evaluation Unit, 2005). In the context of art education, the aforementioned aims can effectively be achieved by using DBAE model in the teaching and learning of the subject. For example; pupils who are involved in creative work (art production) could attain attributes such as; practical skills, problem solving skills, curiosity, critical thinking, self-reliant, inquiry skills, creativity and developing their own special interests, artistic talents and skills whereas; those engaged in 'art criticism' could develop skills of interpersonal, inquiry, assertiveness, self-evaluation capabilities, self-esteem, communication, open-mindedness and respect for the environment and for one's own life. When critically examining an artwork, one understands it better and hence respect and appreciates the piece of work. Artists refer to this as aesthetics (appreciation of the beauty around you). Children who are equipped with all these skills will be prepared for the world of work as per the RNPE (1994) requirement.

Creative and Performing Arts Syllabus Attainment Targets

After examining the relevant education documents, CAPA Syllabus specifically the upper primary level, was examined in relation to DBAE with more attention to Art Education which is the focus of the study. It is evident from the Creative and Performing Arts syllabus that there is no mention of the DBAE approach under all the arts disciplines, to sensitise teachers on its components which when incorporated in the teaching and learning of visual arts, could help pupils attain a more thorough comprehension of in the area. Nevertheless, the document has stipulated goals which pupils should have acquired when completing the primary education of which some matched some of the DBAE components. These requirements are referred to as attainment targets and they are discussed below: The attainment targets according to the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation (2005) were developed as general guidelines for all the CAPA disciplines therefore; the ones relevant for art education were identified and presented in table 1. An attempt was made to categorise these attainment targets according to DBAE disciplines believed to be matching them so as to help readers who could have interest in adopting DBAE framework to get more clarity on issue. The allocation has been justified by suggesting activities which pupils could be engaged in to address specific DBAE components and hence achieve specific attainment targets.

Table 1: CAPA Attainment Targets for Upper primary in relation to DBAE Framework

Attainment Targets Category	Components of each Attainment Target	DBAE	Activities
Knowledge and Understanding	<p>Knowledge and understanding of art media, techniques and processes used in CAPA.</p> <p>Knowledge and understanding of own culture and others, and how they relate to CAPA.</p> <p>Knowledge and understanding of the art elements, principles of design and concepts as applied in CAPA.</p> <p>Acquire problem solving skills using design process.</p>	<p>Art Criticism</p> <p>Art history.</p> <p>Art Criticism</p> <p>Art Production & Art Criticism</p>	<p>Analysing how art elements and design principles are used in an artwork.</p> <p>Learning how local & other art works evolved over time in terms of media, techniques, place, time and reason for creation.</p> <p>Critiquing artwork to find out how art elements and design principles were applied to create an artwork.</p> <p>Studying how other artists created a specific product in terms of media, techniques and processes & also explore media & techniques.</p>
Communication	<p>Understanding and use of CAPA language.</p> <p>Understanding and appreciation in the use of verbal and non-verbal forms of communication.</p>	<p>Art Criticism</p> <p>Art Criticism, Art History & Aesthetics</p>	<p>Talking about an artwork</p> <p>Using Art concepts to talk about an artwork to understand its origin, media & techniques.</p>
Practical/Manipulative Skills	<p>Dexterity through working with art media.</p> <p>Practical skills in manipulating materials into useful products.</p> <p>Skills in the efficient use and management of resources</p>	<p>Art Production</p>	<p>Creating artwork and storing its media appropriately.</p>
Creativity	<p>Creative skills through designing and making products.</p> <p>Develop a project from a simple theme or concept.</p>	<p>Art Production</p> <p>Art Production</p>	<p>Creating artwork.</p> <p>Communicating a specific theme through Visual.</p>
Attitudes	<p>Awareness and appreciating of indigenous materials/activities.</p> <p>Positive attitudes towards practical activities.</p> <p>A spirit of self-reliant.</p> <p>Interpersonal skills through participation in teamwork activities.</p> <p>Awareness and appreciation of the value of culture, beliefs and practices.</p> <p>Desirable attitudes towards health and safety practices.*</p>	<p>Art history, Aesthetics & Art Production</p> <p>Art Production & Art Criticism</p> <p>Art Production All DBAE disciplines</p> <p>Art history & Aesthetics</p> <p>Art Production</p>	<p>Studying how art evolved over time & exploration of local media</p> <p>Creating & critiquing artwork.</p> <p>Working independently on a practical project.</p> <p>Critiquing and creating artwork considering both traditional & contemporary media & techniques (groupwork).</p> <p>Discussion of art piece created with traditional media & techniques & created for cultural purposes.</p> <p>Learning how to work safely with art media include safe storage.</p>

It is interesting to realise that CAPA's attainment targets for upper primary tally with the aims of policies; RNPE (1994), ETSSP (2015-2020) and NCAF (2015) requirements and the Basic Education aims which the primary education is part of. The skills advocated by these documents are similar and requires expects from disciplines to identify appropriate approaches to address them so as to produced graduates with diverse education in all the areas of learning. Thus, although the results from the three policies, Botswana Basic Education and Primary Education

Programmes revealed that the documents did not mention the concept of DBAE in their content, one could argue that these are general aims designed to guide all education curricular developers on what is expected of children at this level. As a result, curriculum developers as experts for different disciplines were expected to identify approaches relevant for their areas when developing the syllabuses and emphasise DBAE as a tool for all the arts methods as the approach is relevant for all the arts disciplines. Thus, it is important to note that having knowledge in DBAE can help teachers come up with activities which could give pupils the opportunity to explore various skills in the arts curriculum because the approach does not leave any gap in learning art content through exploration of media, processes and techniques and talking about art works and their origins (Dobbs, 1992).

As aforementioned, the art education section in the CAPA syllabus was browsed through to check if there was any communication on DBAE mode of teaching and learning visual art. Like in other aspects of the primary education programme, the art education section does not mention the concept of DBAE approach. It has stipulated the general and specific objectives without making any reference to DBAE. However, the discipline of Art production is emphasized followed by art criticism. Aesthetics does not come out clearly and art history seems to have been seriously ignored. This curriculum therefore, needs teachers with DBAE knowledge so as to closely study the objectives and find ways of incorporating the four disciplines in their teaching and hence making art education more comprehensive to effectively address all the primary education attainment targets for CAPA. Thus, student-teachers need appropriate pedagogy programme which emphasizes DBAE framework in visual arts so as to help them impart comprehensive visual arts education to learners; hence produce all-rounded graduates in the area well-prepared for the world of work.

Conclusion and Recommendations

The document analysis data revealed that education policy documents suggested diverse knowledge and skills for basic education learners, to guide curriculum designers from various disciplines to create programmes meant to produce quality graduates at that level who could cope with the outside industry globally. Skills such as; practical, problem solving, critical thinking, self-reliant, research, self-evaluation capabilities, desirable attitudes are emphasised by all the education policies and programmes and hence need for having informed instructors on the ground who could design relevant curricular and adopt appropriate methods such as DBAE for the arts which could help achieve prescribed knowledge, skills and learners' positive attitudes in specific disciplines. As a result, one would argue that not mentioning DBAE in both the CAPA attainment targets and visual arts module was a huge omission; considering that most of the teachers who handled the subjects are non-specialists hence needed guideline on effective approaches to teaching the subject. Visual arts module objectives seems to emphasise the discipline of art production and art criticism compared to other two disciplines. As a result, the study that the education system Botswana should incorporate DBAE approach in the arts syllabus so as to guide teachers who could be lacking knowledge and skills of this important approach to art teaching and learning. Thus, the intension is to organise a workshop for various education personnel to share with them the DBAE approach to teaching the arts. In addition, a study to observe primary school teachers implementation of visual arts curriculum is necessary, to examine the extent to which they incorporate DBAE framework in their teaching and children's learning. This study can further be extended to secondary schools which is also a

component of basic education and teacher-training institutions; to examine the extent to which teachers are prepared for DBAE framework. A workshop for various education personnel could follow, to share with them the DBAE approach to teaching and learning the arts.

References

Agosto, M. *Comprehensive Disciplined-Based Art Education*. Buffalo: Art Education Department. (retrieved from www.buffaloschools.org, 23 October, 2018).

Alabama Institute for Education in the Arts (2004). (Retrieved from www.artseducation.org/dbae.html 22 October, 2018)

Atkinson, P. A. & Coffey, A. (2004). *Analysing documentary realities* in D. Silverman (Ed.), *Qualitative research: Theory, method and practice*. London: Sage, 56–75

Bamford, A. (2006). *The Wow Factor: Global Research Compendium on the Impact of the Arts in Education*. New York: Waxmann Münster.

Bowe, G. (2009). Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9(2), 28-40.

Corbin, J. & Strauss, A. (2008). Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Strauss, A. & Corbin, J. (1990). Basics of qualitative research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Turner, B. A. (1983). The use of grounded theory for the qualitative analysis of organisational behaviour. *Journal of Management Studies*, 20(3), 333–348.

Chanda, J. and Basinger, A. M. (2000). *Understanding the Cultural Meaning of Selected African Ndop Statues. The Use of Art History Constructivist Inquiry Methods*. Washington DC: Education Resources Information Center.

Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2002). *Lower Primary School Syllabus, Standard One to Four*. Gaborone: Ministry of Education.

Curriculum Development and Evaluation Department (2005). *Upper Primary School Syllabus, Standard One to Four*. Gaborone: Ministry of Education.

Danko-McGhee (2006). Nurturing Aesthetics in Young Children: Developmentally Appropriate Art Viewing Experiences. *The Journal of the National Art Education Association*, 59(3), 20-24, 33-35.

Dash, P. (2006). 'Heritance, Identity and Belonging: African Caribbean Students and Art Education.' *The International Journal of Art and Design Education*. 25 (3), 256 – 267.

- Dhillon, P. A. (2006) *Aesthetics Education*. Urbana-Champaign: The University of Illinois Press.
- Dichaba, E. (2002). *A Thematic Based Approach Curriculum For Pedagogical Training of Junior Secondary School Teachers In Botswana*. New Britain: Central Connecticut State University.
- Dobbs, S.M. (1992). *The DBAE Handbook: An Overview of the Discipline-Based Art Education*. Los Angeles: Getty Centre for Education in the Arts.
- Feldman, E.B. (1994). *Practical Art Criticism*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Greer, W.D. (1993). Developments in Discipline-Based Art Education (DBAE): From Art Education Towards Art Education. *A Journal of Issues and Research*. 34 (2), 91-101.
- Hickman, R. (2005). *Critical Studies in Art and Design*. Bristol: NSEAD.
- Lampert, N. (2006). Critical Thinking Dispositions as an Outcome of Art Education. *A Journal of Issues and Research in Art Education*, 47(3), 215-228.
- Lindstrom, L. (2007) Creativity: What is it? Can you assess it? Can it be taught? *The international journal of Aesthetic Education*, 22(1) 143–55.
- Mannathoko (2000). Interpreting the new lower primary art and craft component of the Creative and Performing Arts, the Botswana National Curriculum. Case studies of four primary schools in the South Central and Central North Regions. An illuminative evaluation. Cardiff: University of Wales Institute Cardiff
- Mannathoko, M.C. (2016). Discipline Based Art Education as an Approach to Art Instruction: The Case of Standard Seven Curriculum in Botswana. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 15(1), 14 – 29.
- Merwe, L. (2007). Assessment in the Learning Area of Arts and Culture. A South African Perspective. *The Journal of Research in Teacher Education*, 14(2), 51-68.
- Phibion, O.S. (2006). *Botswana Primary school Teachers' Perception on the Introduction of the Creative and Performing Arts (CAPA) A case of Lobatse town (Urban) and Tlokweng Village (Semi-Urban) schools*. Gaborone: University of Botswana.
- Phuthego, M. (2007). An Evaluation of the Indigenous Musical Arts in the Creative and Performing Arts Syllabus and the Implementation thereof in the Primary Schools Curriculum in Botswana. Unpublished DMusic Thesis. Pretoria: University of Pretoria.
- Ragans, R. (ed) (2000) *Art Talk*. Ohio: MacGraw-Hill Publishing Company.

Republic of Botswana (1994). *The Training Sector Strategies Plan (ETSSP) (2015-2020)*. Gaborone: Government Printer.

Republic of Botswana (1994). *The National Curriculum and Assessment Framework (NCAF, 2015)*. Gaborone: Government Printer.

Republic of Botswana (2016). *Vision 2036: Achieving Prosperity For All*. Gaborone: Government Printers.

Republic of Botswana, (1993). *Report of the National Commission on Education*. Gaborone: Government Printers.

Republic of Botswana, (1994). *The Revised National Policy on Education*. Gaborone: Government Printers.

Rapley, T. (2007). *Doing conversation, discourse and document analysis*. London: Sage.

Shusterman, R. (2006). Aesthetic experience: From analysis to Eros. *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 64(22), 217-229.

Szekely, G (2005) Teaching Students to become Independent Artists. *The Journal of the National Art Education Association* 58(1), 41 – 51.

Watts, R. (2005) Attitudes to Making Art in the Primary School. *The International Journal of Art and Design Education*, 38(1), 243.

Wright, C. (1995). *Subject Combinations and Time-Tabling for Basic Education in Botswana*. Gaborone: Ministry of Education.

Yin, R. K. (2003). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Zander, M.J. (2004) Becoming Dialogical: Creating a Place for Dialogue in Art Education. *The Journal of the National Art Education Association*, 57(3), 48 – 53.